



City of Menominee

City Hall • 2511 10th Street • Menominee, MI 49858-1995

Phone (906) 863-2656 • FAX (906) 863-3266

July 6, 2018

Dear Members:

Please be informed that a meeting of the Finance Committee is scheduled for Tuesday, July 10, 2018 at 5:30 p.m. in the Municipal Complex Council Chambers. A quorum of City Council may be present.

AGENDA

- 1) Approval of agenda.
- 2) Minutes of the June 12, 2018 meeting.
- 3) Request to waive launch fees for Brown Trout Derby participants.
- 4) DPW front end loader lease/purchase.
- 5) Master Use Plan update.
- 6) June bills.
- 7) Year to date financials.
- 8) Public comment.
- 9) Adjourn.

TO: Jean Stegeman, Mayor
Frank Pohlmann, Chair
Steve Fifarek
William Plemel

C: Tony Graff, City Manager
Kathy Brofka, City Clerk/Treasurer

C: Josh Jones
Dennis Klitzke
Nicholas Malone
Heather Nelson
Douglas Robinson

Requests from individuals with disabilities who need special accommodations to participate in this meeting or hearing should be made to the City Clerk's Office at 1-906-863-2656 with as much advanced notice prior to the meeting as possible.

The City of Menominee is an Equal Opportunity Provider and Employer



	Smith Group	McKenna
Work Program: Project Overview (Describe the general project approach & process to be employed)	22 4 Yes	21 2 Yes
Work Program: Describe the process approach that was used in the past to successfully complete similar projects.	21 4 Yes	17 1 Yes 1 No
Work Program: Describe the proposed project schedule including timeline of major milestones, deliverables, and completion.	22 3 Yes	22 2 Yes
Firms Experience & Qualifications	29.5 2 Yes	21.5 1 No
Consultant Personnel Experience & Qualifications	31.5 1 Yes	24.5 1 Yes
Review Submitted Timeframe Flow Chart (Reasonable Expectations to meet important project targets)	20 2 Yes	21 2 Yes
Estimated Costs to meet Master Plan Objectives & Overall Completion.	25 2 Yes	19 1 No
The firm's general approach to the project. Although the City has identified the general nature of services required, the consultants is given leeway toward the approach to the methodology to provide proposed services...adaptability, innovation, etc.	29.5 1 Yes	21 1 Yes
Understanding Menominee's Culture & History as it applies to vision and strategic planning	26 1 Yes	27 1 Yes
Capacity to perform the work in a timely manner, respond to inquiries and schedule of the City and; dedicate the appropriate personnel as the schedule dictates.	25.5 1 Yes	26.5 1 Yes
Experience and Ability to work with citizens, staff, commissions and elected officials.	27 1 Yes	22.5 1 Yes
Past performance on contracts with public agencies including such factors as quality of work, cost control, and demonstrated ability to meet schedule deadlines.	24 1 Yes	19.5 1 Yes
Knowledgably and Experience with the MEDC's Redevelopment Ready Communities Program and Michigan Main Street Program	35.5 1 Yes	22.5 1 Yes
Consultant's Presentation – Overall Rating	35	26
TOTALS	373.5 24 Yes	311 14 Yes 3 No



City of Menominee
Council Committee
Agenda Item

TITLE: Update Master Use Plan	
Requesting Agency: Administration	Meeting Date: July 10, 2018
Contact: Tony Graff, City Manger	Public Hearing:
Phone: 906-863-1747	Advertising Date:
Attachments: Presentation Scorecard Summary	Council Ward:

PURPOSE: The current Master Use Plan was prepared by CUPPAD and adopted by the City Council July 2010 and the Master Use Plan should be updated every 5 years per state statutes. A RFP was prepared by the City Manager and published as recommended by the Planning Commission on April 10, 2018 to solicit additional proposals beyond the CUPPAD proposal.

BACKGROUND: The CUPPAD proposal was \$10,712 and was presented to the Planning Commission on 3/1/2018 and the Finance Committee on 3/15/2018. After comments by the Finance Committee the proposal was revised with a cost \$15,228 which was plan to be presented to the Planning Commission 4/10/2018. The Planning Commission decided on 4/10/2018 to recommend to City Manager Graff to prepare a RFP to update the Master Use Plan instead of the only proposal by CUPPAD. The RFP was prepared and advertised on May 3, 2018 and the submittal date was May 24, 2018.

The City received four (4) proposals: SmithGroup \$29,930, McKenna \$35,000, Beckett & Raeder \$55,880 & CZB, LLC, \$68,049. The proposals reviewed by staff with the SmithGroup and McKenna invited to give a presentation at a Joint Meeting with the City Council, Planning Commission & Zoning Board of Appeals which was on June 28, 2018 at 6:00 pm at Spies Public Library.

The three boards were given a scorecard to tabulate each presentation (see attached summary). The SmithGroup's score was 438.5 with 24 Yes and McKenna's score was 365 with 14 Yes & 3 No.

The highlights from the scorecards from the Smith Group score is...high in experience and qualifications; general approach to the project; experience and ability to work with citizens, staff, commission and elected officials; and knowledgeable and experience with the MEDC's Redevelopment Readiness Community and Main Street Programs.

The FY 2017/18 allocated \$5,000 for CUPPAD to perform the Update and this was not expended. The original plan during the budget workshops was to fund the CUPPAD proposal with \$5,000 FY17/18 and an additional \$10,000 FY18/19.

BUDGET IMPACT: The FY18/19 has \$10,000 allocated for this project in Economic Development Contract Services 101-728.000-818.000. Therefore, if the contract for SmithGroup is approved this line item would need to be adjusted with an increase of \$20,000.

Agenda Item: _____

STAFF RECOMMENDATION / ACTION REQUESTED: Manager Tony Graff is recommending approving the SmithGroup proposal with an amount not to exceed \$30,000 and to use fund balance in the amount of \$25,000 to increase Contract Services line item 101-728.000-818.000 to \$30,000.

	Smith Group	McKenna
Work Program: Project Overview (Describe the general project approach & process to be employed)	27 4 Yes	25 2 Yes
Work Program: Describe the process approach that was used in the past to successfully complete similar projects.	26 4 Yes	21 1 Yes 1 No
Work Program: Describe the proposed project schedule including timeline of major milestones, deliverables, and completion.	27 3 Yes	27 2 Yes
Firms Experience & Qualifications	34.5 2 Yes	25.5 1 No
Consultant Personnel Experience & Qualifications	36.5 1 Yes	28.5 1 Yes
Review Submitted Timeframe Flow Chart (Reasonable Expectations to meet important project targets)	25 2 Yes	25 2 Yes
Estimated Costs to meet Master Plan Objectives & Overall Completion.	30 2 Yes	23 1 No
The firm's general approach to the project. Although the City has identified the general nature of services required, the consultants is given leeway toward the approach to the methodology to provide proposed services...adaptability, innovation, etc.	34.5 1 Yes	24 1 Yes
Understanding Menominee's Culture & History as it applies to vision and strategic planning	31 1 Yes	31 1 Yes
Capacity to perform the work in a timely manner, respond to inquiries and schedule of the City and; dedicate the appropriate personnel as the schedule dictates.	30.5 1 Yes	31.5 1 Yes
Experience and Ability to work with citizens, staff, commissions and elected officials.	32 1 Yes	26.5 1 Yes
Past performance on contracts with public agencies including such factors as quality of work, cost control, and demonstrated ability to meet schedule deadlines.	24 1 Yes	19.5 1 Yes
Knowledgably and Experience with the MEDC's Redevelopment Ready Communities Program and Michigan Main Street Program	40.5 1 Yes	27.5 1 Yes
Consultant's Presentation – Overall Rating	40	30
TOTALS	438.5 24 Yes	365 14 Yes 3 No

MASTER PLAN UPDATE PROPOSALS

TABULATION

MAY 24, 2018

Present: Tony Graff and Susan Johnson

PROPOSER	AMOUNT
CZB, LLC	\$68,049.
McKenna Northfield MI	\$35,000.
Smith Group Ann Arbor MI	\$29,930.
Beckett and Raeder Ann Arbor MI	\$55,880.